Fatigue management tools: SMS, FRMS and SAFE

Dr Karen Robertson
A presentation to: SAFE Europe

30th March 2010
Contents

01 Background

02 Current approaches to Fatigue Management

03 SMS, FRMS & SAFE
01
Background
Fatigue – What is it?

ICAO (International Civil Aviation Organisation) definition:

‘A physiological state of reduced mental or physical performance capability resulting from sleep loss or extended wakefulness and/or physical activity that can impair a crew member’s alertness and ability to safely operate an aircraft or perform safety related duties’.
Effects of fatigue

Fatigue is an inevitable consequence of disrupted sleep schedules. For pilots it can mean:

- Inaccurate flying
- Missed radio calls
- System warnings missed or slow to pick up
- Routine tasks performed inaccurately or forgotten
- Loss of situational awareness
- Micro sleeps
- Task fixation
- Poor CRM – everyone is on transmit, no one on receive

But fatigue is not exclusive to civil aviation or to pilots……any member of the team can be affected - managers, rostering staff, maintenance staff

Estimated that fatigue contributes to approx. 15-20% of commercial aviation accidents
Fatigue-related accidents

- 1993 Kalitta International DC-8-61F at Guantanamo Bay
- 1994 Air Algerie737-200F at Coventry, UK
- 1997 Korean Air 747-300 at Guam
- 1999 American Airlines MD-82 at Little Rock, USA
- 2001 CrossairBAe146 at Zurich, Switzerland
- 2002 AgcoCorp Challenger 604 at Birmingham, UK
- 2004 MK Airlines 747-200F at Halifax
- 2004 Corporate Airlines BAeJetstream31 at Kirksville, USA
- 2004 Med Air Learjet35A at San Bernadino, California
- 2005 Loganair B-N Islander at Machrihanish, UK
- 2006 Comair CRJ100 at Lexington KY
- 2007 Cathay Pacific 747F ground collision at Stockholm Arlanda
- 2009 ColganDash 8-Q400 at Buffalo, NY
Risk factors for fatigue

There are many factors associated with individual duties and the way in which duties are put together to form a schedule that can contribute to the development of fatigue. For example:

- Extended duty hours
- Reduced rest between duties
- Long commuting times
- Split duties
- Standby duties
- Disrupted sleep pattern
- Time zone transitions
- Consecutive duties
- High workload
- Multiple sectors
- Early starts
02
Current approaches to Fatigue Management
Many countries have prescriptive flight time limitation (FTL) regulations

- Limits defined for a range of issues e.g. duty length, duty hours, number of sectors
- UK CAP371 (Civil Air Publication 371: The avoidance of fatigue in aircrews) is probably one of the most detailed regulatory FTL schemes
  - Other guidance available for aircraft maintenance personnel and air traffic controllers

In commercial aviation, these prescriptive regulatory systems are often supplemented by LBA’s (labour agreements) and local arrangements
Prescriptive FTLs often create the illusion of ‘safe’ and ‘unsafe’ boundaries

- If the operator meets the requirements of the regulations the operation is deemed to be ‘safe’

- Difficult to design a comprehensive scheme that covers all factors that could contribute to fatigue
  - Personal issues influence levels of alertness
    - Disturbed sleep due to young children
    - Long commute to work
Working outside current regulations

There are situations where it may be necessary to work outside existing regulations

- For example, introduction of new operations, changes to existing schedules

- In the UK this is managed as a ‘variation’, where the operator has to demonstrate to the CAA that the proposed change/s are safe and do not result in high levels of fatigue
  - Generally, this involves the collection of objective data
    - Analysis of FDM data
    - Modelling of proposed route and estimated levels of fatigue
    - In-flight study of aircrew fatigue
Other approaches to managing fatigue

Some operators have taken the data collection process a step further.

**easyJet UK**

- Requirement to work consecutive early and late duties
- Demonstrated to the UK CAA that the approach they proposed was safe
- Continue to use objective data to influence design of schedules

**Air New Zealand**

- Review fatigue-related issues on an annual basis
  - Setup a scientific advisory committee to provide an independent review
- Routinely, carry out in-flight investigations of specific routes
FRM and Ultra-Long-Range (ULR) operations

The introduction of a new type of operation, ULR, was associated with the use of FRM techniques

- Workshops used to develop a methodology to managing fatigue
- Modelling of the proposed routes and operational constraints using SAFE (System for Aircrew Fatigue Evaluation)
- Guidance provided to aircrew on fatigue management strategies
- In-flight fatigue monitoring during the first couple of months of the operation and six months after the operation had commenced
03
SMS, FRMS and SAFE
ICAO: Safety Management System (SMS)

Safety Management System

- SMS is ‘the systematic management of the operational risks associated with flight, engineering and ground activities in order to achieve as high a level of safety performance as is reasonably practicable’

- Requires an explicit statement of a company’s safety policy and corporate responsibility

- ICAO SMS came into force in January 2009
  - In Europe, some member states have mandated it in full and others have deferred implementation until 2012 when the European regulator (EASA) will mandate implementation
Fatigue Risk Management System (FRMS)

FRMS has been defined as the management of fatigue in a manner appropriate to the level of risk of exposure and the nature of the operation, in order to minimise the adverse effects of fatigue on the safety of operations. It should be:

- Part of the company SMS
- Scientifically driven
- A continuous and adaptive process of monitoring and managing the risk of fatigue
- Aiming to manage fatigue irrespective of the causes

A FRMS should enhance safety through a reduction in errors, incidents and accidents

- It is an holistic risk management approach that includes risk assessments, mitigation strategies, training and education programs, monitoring systems and feedback mechanisms to update and respond to change.
- Operationally it may be viewed from a prevention, prediction, detection and intervention perspective
SMS and FRMS

Safety Management System
Based on a just culture
Collaborative
Proactive

Fatigue Risk Management System

Fatigue Policy & objectives
Fatigue Risk Management
Fatigue Safety Assurance
Fatigue Safety Promotion
SMS principles and their link to FRMS (1)

**SMS**

- Safety Policy and Objectives
- Senior Management Commitment
- Safety Management Oversight

**FRMS**

- Non-punitive Fatigue Risk Management Policy
- ‘Just’ culture
- Fatigue Safety Action Plan
- Documented processes and procedures for FRMS implementation
SMS principles and their link to FRMS (2)

**SMS**

**Safety Risk Management**
- Hazard identification
- Risk Assessment

**FRMS**
- Fatigue risk assessment tools
- Crew fatigue reporting
- Strategic, scientifically driven crew scheduling
- Validated, timely fatigue mitigation strategies
- Procedures to investigate and record fatigue-related incidents
- Data collection and assessment
Fatigue assessment tool: SAFE (System for Aircrew Fatigue Evaluation)

Standalone computer program

- Allows the user to obtain an estimate of fatigue during individual duty periods and across successive duties

Incorporates the QinetiQ Alertness Model

- Subsequent refinement of the Model has occurred over a number years and has allowed information to be included that is specific to air operations. For example:
  - Time zone transitions
  - Crew composition
  - Rest in-flight
Why implement a FRMS?

Prescriptive regulations provide only one chance to manage fatigue

FRMS provides more opportunities and greater defences against the risk of fatigue

- More comprehensive
- Should enhance safety (adds defences, additional measures, analysis)
- Provides better understanding of the issues influencing fatigue
The FRMS Forum (frmsforum.org) has been setup

- Not for profit organisation
- Run by the aviation industry for the aviation industry
- Membership provides access to documents, advice and meetings
  - Separate areas for operators, unions, regulators and scientists
Thank you for your attention. Any questions?